CITY OF NEWTON, MASSACHUSETTS PURCHASING DEPARTMENT COMPARISON OF BIDS

INVITATION #17-64 Washington Street at Harvard Street Intersection Safety Improvements

Bid Opening: February 23, 2017 at 11:00 a.m. Public Works - Stephen Simiglou

| Bidders | A. R. Belli, Inc. | Charles Contracting | Dagle Electrical | |
|--|-------------------|----------------------------|------------------|--|
| Washington Street at Harvard Street Intersection Safety Improvements | \$454,418.00 | \$495,380.00 | \$527,392.00 | |
| Add Alternate | \$83,439.00 | \$79,688.00 | \$59,845.00 | |
| TOTAL BID PRICE | \$537,857.00 | \$575,068.00 | \$587,237.00 | |
| Award Recommended To: | | Chief Procurement Officer | Date | |
| ADD ALTERNATE: DATE | | ong Premimen Office | | |
| Department Head Date | | Mayor or his designee | Date | |
| | | | | |
| NOTES REGARDING SUBMITTED BIDS total corrected by Excel | | | | |

| Bidders | QTY | UNIT | A. R. Be | elli, Inc. | Charles Co | ontracting | Dagle E | lectrical |
|---|-----------|-----------|------------------------------------|--------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| ITEM DESCRIPTION & BID PRICE | | | Unit Price | Annual | Unit Price | Annual | Unit Price | Annual |
| 102.2 - TREE TRIMMING | 1 | LS | \$1,000.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$100.00 | \$100.00 |
| 102.51 - INDIVIDUAL TREE PROTECTION | 1 | EA | \$277.00 | \$277.00 | \$230.00 | \$230.00 | \$100.00 | \$100.00 |
| 120. – EARTH EXCAVATION ADD ALTERNATE - 120. – EARTH EXCAVATION | 400 20 | CY CY | \$10.00 \$10.00 | \$4,000.00 \$200.00 | \$45.00 \$45.00 | \$18,000.00 \$900.00 | \$1.00 \$1.00 | \$400.00 \$20.00 |
| 141.1 – TEST PIT FOR EXPLORATION | 5 | CY | \$115.00 | \$575.00 | \$98.00 | \$490.00 | \$75.00 | \$375.00 |
| 151. – GRAVEL BORROW | 260 | CY | \$1.00 | \$260.00 | \$38.00 | \$9,880.00 | \$1.00 | \$260.00 |
| ADD ALTERNATE - 151. – GRAVEL BORROW | 15 | CY | \$1.00 | \$15.00 | \$38.00 | \$570.00 | \$1.00 | \$15.00 |
| 170. – FINE GRADING AND COMPACTING | 950 | SY | \$10.00 | \$9,500.00 | \$14.80 | \$14,060.00 | \$20.00 | \$19,000.00 |
| ADD ALTERNATE - 170. – FINE GRADING AND COMPACTING | 60 | SY | \$10.00 | \$600.00 | \$14.80 | \$888.00 | \$20.00 | \$1,200.00 |
| 191. –DRIVE SAMPLE BORINGS 191.10 – HOLLOW STEM AUGER BORING | 40 30 | FT | \$1.00 | \$40.00 | \$30.00 | \$1,200.00 | \$1.00 | \$40.00 |
| 191.10 – HOLLOW STEM AUGER BORING 191.11 – CORE BORING | 30 | FT FT | \$1.00 \$1.00 | \$30.00 \$30.00 | \$30.00 \$30.00 | \$900.00 \$900.00 | \$50.00 \$1.00 | \$1,500.00 \$30.00 |
| 193. MOBILIZATION AND DISMANTILING OF BORING EQUIPMENT | 1 | LS | \$7,800.00 | \$7,800.00 | \$3,200.00 | \$3,200.00 | \$3,500.00 | \$3,500.00 |
| 220.7 – SANITARY STRUCTURE ADJUSTED | 3 | EA | \$385.00 | \$1,155.00 | \$350.00 | \$1,050.00 | \$300.00 | \$900.00 |
| 220.8 – SANITARY STRUCTURE REMODELED | 2 | EA | \$850.00 | \$1,700.00 | \$650.00 | \$1,300.00 | \$750.00 | \$1,500.00 |
| 222.3 – FRAME AND GRATE (OR COVER) MUNICIPAL STANDARD | 2 | EA | \$700.00 | \$1,400.00 | \$700.00 | \$1,400.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$2,000.00 |
| 357. – GATE BOX | 2 | EA | \$250.00 | \$500.00 | \$450.00 | \$900.00 | \$200.00 | \$400.00 |
| 358. – GATE BOX ADJUSTED | 5 | EA | \$177.00 | \$885.00 | \$185.00 | \$925.00 | \$200.00 | \$1,000.00 |
| 381. – SERVICE BOX 381.3 – SERVICE BOX ADJUSTED | 2 5 | EA EA | \$225.00 \$117.00 | \$450.00 \$585.00 | \$300.00 \$140.00 | \$600.00 \$700.00 | \$200.00 \$250.00 | \$400.00 \$1,250.00 |
| 415. – PAVEMENT MICROMILLING | 1960 | SY | \$7.20 | \$14,112.00 | \$140.00 \$13.25 | \$25,970.00 | \$9.00 | \$17,640.00 |
| 460. – HOT MIX ASPHALT | 230 | TON | \$119.00 | \$27,370.00 | \$145.00 | \$33,350.00 | \$165.00 | \$37,950.00 |
| 464. – ASPHALT EMULSION FOR TACK COAT | 200 | GAL | \$11.00 | \$2,200.00 | \$11.00 | \$2,200.00 | \$10.00 | \$2,000.00 |
| 464.5 – HOT POURED RUBBERIZED ASPHALT SEALER | 1540 | FT | \$0.80 | \$1,232.00 | \$2.00 | \$3,080.00 | \$1.00 | \$1,540.00 |
| 472. – HOT MIX ASPHALT FOR MISCELLANEOUS WORK | 25 | TON | \$239.00 | \$5,975.00 | \$300.00 | \$7,500.00 | \$150.00 | \$3,750.00 |
| ADD ALTERNATE - 472. – HOT MIX ASPHALT FOR MISCELLANEOUS WORK | 1 | TON | \$239.00 | \$239.00 | \$300.00 | \$300.00 | \$150.00 | \$150.00 |
| 482.6 – SAWING PAVEMENT AND SIDEWALK JOINTS | 1400 | FT | \$1.00 | \$1,400.00 | \$5.00 | \$7,000.00 | \$3.00 | \$4,200.00 |
| ADD ALTERNATE - 482.6 – SAWING PAVEMENT AND SIDEWALK JOINTS 504. – GRANITE CURB TYPE VA4-STRAIGHT | 70 470 | FT FT | \$1.00 \$49.00 | \$70.00 \$23,030.00 | \$5.00 \$44.00 | \$350.00 \$20,680.00 | \$3.00 \$47.00 | \$210.00 \$22,090.00 |
| 504.1 – GRANITE CURB TYPE VA4-STRAIGHT | 110 | FT | \$54.50 | \$5,995.00 | \$52.00 | \$5,720.00 | \$57.00 | \$6,270.00 |
| 509. – GRANITE TRANSITION CURB FOR WHEELCHAIR RAMPS - STRAIGHT | 40 | FT | \$57.50 | \$2,300.00 | \$44.00 | \$1,760.00 | \$57.00 | \$2,280.00 |
| 509.1 – GRANITE TRANSITION CURB FOR WHEELCHAIR RAMPS - CURVED | 40 | FT | \$57.50 | \$2,300.00 | \$48.00 | \$1,920.00 | \$57.00 | \$2,280.00 |
| ADD ALTERNATE - 509.1 – GRANITE TRANSITION CURB FOR WHEELCHAIR RAMPS - CURVED | 30 | FT | \$57.50 | \$1,725.00 | \$48.00 | \$1,440.00 | \$57.00 | \$1,710.00 |
| 516. – GRANITE CURB CORNER TYPE A | 6 | EA | \$388.00 | \$2,328.00 | \$240.00 | \$1,440.00 | \$295.00 | \$1,770.00 |
| 627.3 – STEEL THRIE BEAM TERMINAL SECTION (SINGLE FACED) | 1 | EA | \$78.00 | \$78.00 | \$220.00 | \$220.00 | \$200.00 | \$200.00 |
| 645.072 – 72 INCH CHAIN LINK FENCE (PIPE TOP RAIL) (LINE POST OPTION) | 50 5 | FT | \$56.00 | \$2,800.00 | \$45.00 | \$2,250.00 | \$50.00 | \$2,500.00 |
| 653.072 -72 INCH CHAIN LINK FENCE CORNER OR INTERMEDIATE BRACE POST 665. – CHAIN LINK FENCE REMOVED AND STACKED | 50 | EA FT | \$229.00 \$10.00 | \$1,145.00 \$500.00 | \$550.00 \$10.00 | \$2,750.00 \$500.00 | \$600.00 \$12.00 | \$3,000.00 \$600.00 |
| 666. – CHAIN LINK FENCE REMOVED AND RESET | 100 | FT | \$27.00 | \$2,700.00 | \$30.00 | \$3,000.00 | \$30.00 | \$3,000.00 |
| 701. – CEMENT CONCRETE SIDEWALK | 700 | SY | \$49.00 | \$34,300.00 | \$48.00 | \$33,600.00 | \$90.00 | \$63,000.00 |
| ADD ALTERNATE - 701 CEMENT CONCRETE SIDEWALK | 30 | SY | \$49.00 | \$1,470.00 | \$48.00 | \$1,440.00 | \$90.00 | \$2,700.00 |
| 701.1 – CEMENT CONCRETE SIDEWALK AT DRIVEWAYS | 110 | SY | \$56.00 | \$6,160.00 | \$60.00 | \$6,600.00 | \$95.00 | \$10,450.00 |
| 701.2 – CEMENT CONCRETE WHEELCHAIR RAMP | 120 | SY | \$53.00 | \$6,360.00 | \$80.00 | \$9,600.00 | \$95.00 | \$11,400.00 |
| ADD ALTERNATE - 701.2 – CEMENT CONCRETE WHEELCHAIR RAMP | 40 | SY | \$53.00 | \$2,120.00 | \$80.00 | \$3,200.00 | \$95.00 | \$3,800.00 |
| 703. – HOT MIX ASPHALT DRIVEWAY 751. – LOAM BORROW | 10 14 | TON CY | \$277.00 \$72.00 | \$2,770.00 \$1,008.00 | \$190.00 \$50.00 | \$1,900.00 \$700.00 | \$275.00 \$60.00 | \$2,750.00 \$840.00 |
| 765 SEEDING | 100 | SY | \$2.00 | \$200.00 | \$2.50 | \$700.00 \$250.00 | \$2.00 | \$200.00 |
| 767.6 – AGED PINE BARK MULCH | 2 | CY | \$85.00 | \$170.00 | \$75.00 | \$150.00 | \$100.00 | \$200.00 |
| 804.3 – 3 INCH ELECTRICAL CONDUIT TYPE NM - PLASTIC-(UL) | 800 | FT | \$18.00 | \$14,400.00 | \$10.00 | \$8,000.00 | \$45.00 | \$36,000.00 |
| 811.30 – PULL BOX 8 X 23 INCHES - SD2.030 | 1 | EA | \$1,229.00 | \$1,229.00 | \$800.00 | \$800.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$1,000.00 |
| 811.31 – PULL BOX 12 X 12 INCHES - SD2.031 | 5 | EA | \$1,177.00 | \$5,885.00 | \$800.00 | \$4,000.00 | \$900.00 | \$4,500.00 |
| 813.81 – SERVICE CONNECTION (UNDERGROUND) | 1 | LS | \$7,800.00 | \$7,800.00 | \$18,000.00 | \$18,000.00 | \$6,000.00 | \$6,000.00 |
| 815.1 – TRAFFIC CONTROL SIGNAL LOCATION NO. 1 | 1 | LS | \$197,900.00 | \$197,900.00 | \$175,000.00 | \$175,000.00 | \$196,400.00 | \$196,400.00 |
| 816.01 TRAFFIC SIGNAL RECONSTRUCTION – LOCATION 2 ADD ALTERNATE - 816.01 TRAFFIC SIGNAL RECONSTRUCTION – LOCATION 2 | 0 | LS LS | \$75,000.00 \$75,000.00 | \$0.00 \$75,000.00 | \$68,600.00 \$68,600.00 | \$0.00 \$68,600.00 | \$48,000.00 \$48,000.00 | \$0.00 \$48,000.00 |
| 815.98 – FOOTING COST ADJUSTMENT | 10 | FT | \$1.00 | \$10.00 | \$100.00 | \$1,000.00 | \$1.00 | \$10.00 |
| 832. – WARNING-REGULATORY AND ROUTE MKR -ALUM. PANEL (TYPE A) | 80 | SF | \$10.00 | \$800.00 | \$11.00 | \$880.00 | \$15.00 | \$1,200.00 |
| 847.1 – SIGN SUP (N/GUIDE) + RTE MKR W/1 BRKWAY POST ASSEMBLY - STEEL | 5 | EA | \$100.00 | \$500.00 | \$112.00 | \$560.00 | \$150.00 | \$750.00 |
| 852. – SAFETY SIGNING FOR CONSTRUCTION OPERATIONS | 120 | SF | \$24.00 | \$2,880.00 | \$19.00 | \$2,280.00 | \$1.00 | \$120.00 |
| 853.1 – PORTABLE BREAKAWAY BARRICADE TYPE III | 3 | EA | \$115.00 | \$345.00 | \$125.00 | \$375.00 | \$1.00 | \$3.00 |
| 856.12 – PORTABLE CHANGEABLE MESSAGE SIGN | 180 | DAY | \$8.00 | \$1,440.00 | \$25.00 | \$4,500.00 | \$1.00 | \$180.00 |
| 859. – REFLECTORIZED DRUM | 1900 | DAY | \$0.35 | \$665.00 | \$0.30 | \$570.00 | \$0.01 | \$19.00 |
| 864.04 – PAVEMENT ARROWS AND LEGENDS REFL. WHITE (THERMOPLASTIC) 866.104 – 4 INCH REFLECTORIZED WHITE LINE (THERMOPLASTIC) | 80 700 | SF FT | \$5.00 \$0.85 | \$400.00 \$595.00 | \$17.00 \$1.50 | \$1,360.00 \$1,050.00 | \$10.00 \$1.50 | \$800.00 \$1,050.00 |
| 866.112 – 12 INCH REFECTORIZED WHITE LINE (THERMOPLASTIC) | 460 | FT | \$0.85 | \$595.00 \$1,012.00 | \$1.50 \$3.00 | \$1,380.00 | \$1.50 \$4.00 | \$1,050.00 |
| 867.104 – 4 INCH REFLECTORIZED YELLOW LINE (THERMOPLASTIC) | 420 | FT | \$0.85 | \$357.00 | \$1.50 | \$630.00 | \$1.50 | \$630.00 |
| 874. – STREET NAME SIGN | 2 | EA | \$95.00 | \$190.00 | \$110.00 | \$220.00 | \$150.00 | \$300.00 |
| 874.2 – TRAFFIC SIGN REMOVED AND RESET | 2 | EA | \$75.00 | \$150.00 | \$100.00 | \$200.00 | \$100.00 | \$200.00 |
| 874.4 – TRAFFIC SIGN REMOVED AND STACKED | 2 | EA | \$10.00 | \$20.00 | \$50.00 | \$100.00 | \$50.00 | \$100.00 |
| 875.1 – PARKING METER REMOVED AND RESET | 10 | EA | \$70.00 | \$700.00 | \$450.00 | \$4,500.00 | \$125.00 | \$1,250.00 |
| 875.2 – PARKING METER REMOVED AND STACKED | 2 | EA | \$10.00 | \$20.00 | \$50.00 | \$100.00 | \$100.00 | \$200.00 |
| 904. – 4000 PSI, ¼ INCH. 610 CEMENT CONCRETE 999. – POLICE DETAILS | 5 800 | CY | \$100.00 \$50.00 | \$500.00 \$40,000.00 | \$200.00 \$50.00 | \$1,000.00 \$40,000.00 | \$275.00 \$51.00 | \$1,375.00 \$40,800.00 |
| 999. – POLICE DETAILS ADD ALTERNATE - 999. – POLICE DETAILS | 40 | HR HR | \$50.00 \$50.00 | \$40,000.00 | \$50.00 \$50.00 | \$40,000.00 | \$51.00 \$51.00 | \$40,800.00 |
| TOTAL | -10 | IIIX | \$50.00 \$2,000.00 \$454,418.00 | | \$495,380.00 \$495,380.00 | | \$51.00 \$2,040.00 \$527,392.00 | |
| ADD ALTERNATE TOTAL | | | | | | | . / | |
| | | | \$83,439.00 | | \$79,688.00 | | \$59,845.00 | |
| TOTAL BID PRICE | | | \$537,8 | 57.00 | \$575,0 | 00.80 | \$587,2 | 257.00 |
| | | | | | | | | |